

SISO C2SIM PDG

SISO C2SIM PDG
SISO PDG Meeting

MEETING RECORD SHEET MINUTES

Date :	3-JAN-2019	Start Time :	09:00 EST	End Time :	10:00 EST	Date Distributed :	26-JAN-2019
Title of Meeting:	<u>SISO C2SIM PDG Meeting (Meeting: 56)</u>						
Location:	Online meeting URL: https://zoom.us/j/942411909				Chair: Dr. Mark Pullen		
Present:	Dr. Mark Pullen – George Mason University, Chair Dr. Samuel Singapogu – George Mason University Dr. Curtis Blais – Naval Postgraduate School Thom DeCarlo – MITRE Dr. Douglas Reece – VT-MAK Kevin Galvin - Thales PDG members: Doug Corner – George Mason University Jim Ruth – Trideum Deryck Arnold – Thales Bruno Gautreau - Airbus						
Next Meeting:	5 FEB 2019 09:00 EST				Prepared by: Samuel Singapogu		

SISO C2SIM PDG

Item	Description	Resp.
AGENDA	<p>Agenda:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Identify participants (all) 2) Revise agenda as necessary (Pullen) 3) Approval for minutes of previous meetings. Available on SISO Digital Library. (DeCarlo) https://www.sisostds.org/DigitalLibrary.aspx?Command=Core_Download&EntryId=49269 4) Status of actions from previous meetings: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Update and distribute OWL-XSD transformation (Blais 15Dec18) b) Update and distribute LOX standard document (Ruth 15Dec18) c) Update and distribute LOX ontology (Reece 15Dec18) d) Update section 5 of standard draft to match v9.5 ontology (Singapogu 15Dec18) e) Create list of classes in LOX that pertain to generic military (Ruth 15Dec18) 5) Posting of latest drafts (Pullen) 6) Status updates <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Consolidated C2SIM standard (Singapogu) b) C2SIM Core Ontology next version (Reece) c) C2SIM Maneuver Warfare Extension draft including ontology status (Ruth & Reece) d) C2SIM Server/ClientLib updates (Corner) e) PSG activities (Blais) 7) Discuss plans for C2SIM PDG/PSG meeting 14Feb19 (Pullen) 8) Comments from Co-Chair, Lead editor, Secretary 	
EVE-01	Opened meeting with Roll Call.	MP
EVE-02	No revisions to the agenda.	MP
EVE-03	<p>Approval for minutes of previous meetings. Available on SISO Digital Library. (DeCarlo)</p> <p style="text-align: center;">https://www.sisostds.org/DigitalLibrary.aspx?Command=Core_Download&EntryId=49325</p> <p>TD: Minutes from the last meeting has been posted online. Motion to accept minutes have been unanimously accepted.</p>	TD
EVE-04	<p>Status of actions from previous meetings:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Update and distribute OWL-XSD transformation (Blais 15Dec18) Pullen: Done. Blais, to clarify, were there any changes in the executable script (included in the standard draft)? Blais: Not sure what is in the current draft but can make sure the latest is included; will send to Singapogu. The logic of the XSL has remained largely unchanged in the last few weeks. The ontology schematics have been updated to work better with the transformation. Have written up a set of requirements/constraints in the ontology that help in the transformation process in paper 13 of the upcoming SISO SIW. Reece: Tangential to the current point but, maybe in the guidance document 	ALL

SISO C2SIM PDG

	<p>we could mention the tool that was used to run the XSLT. Pullen: Blais, is that in the paper? Blais: Not sure; the tool is XMLSpy; will include a pointer to XMLSpy in the paper. In theory, any XSLT engine should be able to execute the XSLT script. Also created a description of the process to create a merged ontology using Protégé; will be useful to merge LOX and SMX as an input to the XSLT transformation. Pullen: Need to run it on the latest ontology that works with the transformation and also to include the XSLT code in the guidance document. AI-M55-1 is marked complete.</p> <p>b) Update and distribute LOX standard document (Ruth 15Dec18) Ruth: Have review input from MSG145; will send out an update to Singapogu. Pullen: Would be good to post it along with the updated standard document. Due date for AI-M54-2 is moved to 31-JAN-2019</p> <p>c) Update and distribute LOX ontology (Reece 15Dec18) Pullen: Last month, during review in the ontology group, we separated military extension from the LOX but coordinated with each other; military extension will be included as part of the core but as a separate ontology that imports the core. Reece, is this right? Reece: Yes, pretty much. The standard military extension (SMX) imports the core and LOX imports SMX. Need to talk to Blais on the last couple of issues in the LOX that impact the transformation process. Minor changes in class names and organization are expected as part of the review later. Pullen: Ideally any substantive changes should be part of or after the MSG-145 review. Due date for AI-M54-3 is moved to 31-JAN-2019</p> <p>d) Update section 5 of standard draft to match v9.5 ontology (Singapogu 15Dec18) Singapogu: Been waiting on issues on Sparx EA license. Meanwhile, been waiting for the ontology update to be ready. Pullen: Singapogu, sent you a list of text and formatting changes. Would be good to have these reviewed and ready. Can engage at GMU to manually generate section 5. Singapogu: Will do; can also send the output of a SPARQL query, which lists all classes and their descriptions as a table; will only need formatting. Due date for AI-M54-4 is moved to 31-JAN-2019.</p> <p>e) Create list of classes in LOX that pertain to generic military (Ruth 15Dec18) Pullen: Already addressed in c; looks like we've struck the right balance in class abstractions at this point. AI-M54-5 is marked complete.</p>	
EVE-05	Posting of latest drafts (Pullen)	MP

SISO C2SIM PDG

	<p>Pullen: Discussion and actions on 4 (d) address this point as well. Might be good to move items under 6 to be moved up the order before 4 in future meetings.</p>	
<p>EVE-06</p>	<p>Status Updates</p> <p>a) Consolidated C2SIM standard (Singapogu) Singapogu: Received comments on a few sections of the standard document; will review and include these changes in the next version (v9) AI-M56-1 is assigned to Singapogu.</p> <p>b) C2SIM Core Ontology next version (Reece) & c) C2SIM Maneuver Warfare Extension draft including ontology status (Ruth & Reece) Reece: A number of cleanup changes and ranges added to data properties that are useful to the transformation process; SMX layer is now part of the core. No longer have classes with multiple inheritance from ConcreteEntity and ActorEntity. Also now have a single C2SIM header that does not refer to any domain actors; separate properties that identify actors. Made a couple of changes based on Bouvier's suggestions. Will send out the updated ontology. Pullen: Corner, are comfortable with the changes Reece described and their impact on the server/client? Corner: Need to review them; so far no major concerns. Pullen: Will need your feedback to make sure it can be implemented. Have you been able to build a test order and test report based on the latest schema? Corner: Not yet; will do. Pullen: Will be useful as I am working on the GUI and VR Forces aspects. Ruth: Will the SMX be part of the extension or the standard document. Pullen: As I see it, it should be part of the standard document with section 5 of the main document having a new sub-section below the core classes that list SMX classes. The LOX classes will be in the LOX document. Reece: Note that SMX has App-6, JC3IEDM, DIS type codes and military tasks; these have been moved from the core to SMX. AI-M56-2 is assigned to Reece.</p> <p>c) C2SIM Server/ClientLib updates (Corner) Corner: First step is make sure the server can parse the schema; the new schema has xs:group definitions so had to update the code to parse groups. Still have infinite loops in execution; not sure if it is triggered by recursion in the XML schema or a bug in the code; will look into it. Reece, want to make sure that we have agreement that the generated schema will not have recursion. Reece: Not sure we have agreement across all classes. We can have a restriction on the ontology, if needed. Pullen: Need to make sure the generated schema can be implemented and avoid problems of previous standard that hindered adoption. Corner: Will review the schema and get back with questions/comments. Pullen: Perhaps need to have recurring agenda item on MSG-145</p>	<p>MP, SS, DR, JR</p>

SISO C2SIM PDG

	<p>experimentation; current timeline of experimentation is in May, CWIX in June and a mini exercise in July. This is all the validation they will do on C2SIM. Need to get C2SIM artifacts ready early (around February) to avoid complexities.</p> <p>d) PSG activities (Blais) Blais: No updates.</p>	
EVE-07	<p>Discuss plans for C2SIM PDG/PSG meeting 14Feb19 (Pullen)</p> <p>Pullen: This year the SISO workshop is moved from September to February; some of us have papers on C2SIM planned for submission. Would be good to have a crisp set of briefings in a two-hour period; don't expect any votes except for having two layers of ontology (core+SMX) in the standard. Might need to update the charter document but don't expect it to be contentious. Any thoughts on this point? Gautreau: Looks good. Galvin: Hope to be at the SIW. Any chance to demonstrate C2SIM at the SIW? Pullen: Not sure; could repeat the I/ITSEC demo but not sure that will be productive. Would be good to use the latest schema to demo using VR Forces, server and maybe JSAF; this should be a soft goal at this point. Arnold: Would like to attend the PSG meeting in February. Pullen: The PDG/PSG meeting is open to all SISO members and will be open for online participation of C2SIM PDG members. Galvin, would like to know the extent of the Australian participation. Galvin: Will find out.</p>	MP
EVE-08	<p>Comments from Co-Chair, Lead editor, Secretary</p> <p>No more comments.</p> <p>Next meeting scheduled for 5-FEB-2019 at 09:00 EST.</p>	MP, KG, SS, TD
EVE-09	ADJOURN	ALL

SISO C2SIM PDG

ANNEX A – ON-GOING ACTIVITIES ITEM TABLE (ordered by Action Item number)

ACTION ITEM TABLE				
<i>AI ID</i>	<i>Description</i>	<i>Assignee</i>	<i>Due date</i>	<i>Status</i>
AI-M54-2	Update and distribute LOX standard document	JR	31-JAN-2018	Open
AI-M54-3	Update and distribute LOX ontology	DR	15-JAN-2018	Open
AI-M54-4	Update section 5 in C2SIM Standard draft to match v9.1 ontology and prune out unneeded elements from Appendix A	SS	15-JAN-2018	Open
AI-M56-1	Update and distribute standard document	SS	31-JAN-2019	Open
AI-M56-2	Update and distribute core and SMX ontology	DR	31-JAN-2019	Open

SISO C2SIM PDG

ANNEX B – CLOSED ACTION ITEM TABLE (ordered by Action Item number)

ACTION ITEM TABLE				
<i>AI ID</i>	<i>Description</i>	<i>Assignee</i>	<i>Closed date</i>	<i>Status</i>
AI-M7-1	To formulate a list of items to progress work on the LDM (for Singapogu to assist)	KGup and SS	02-APR-2015	Closed
AI-M7-2	Prepare an abstract for a paper at NATO M&S reporting on the SISO C2SIM process	MP	06-APR-2015	Closed
AI-M8-1	To contact Dick Brown and Adam Brook for review	CB	09-APR-2015	Closed
AI-M8-2	To complete Guide document and provide for PSG review	CB	03-SEP-2015	Closed
AI-M8-3	To report initial results on standard approach to extending LDM at 29 Apr meeting	RW and SD	2-JUN-2015	Closed
AI-M9-5	Provide improvements to submitted Use Cases	LK	10-NOV-2015	Closed
AI-M9-2	Editor work on Guidance document available for PDG review	CB	10-JUN-2015	Closed
AI-M9-3	Post received Use Cases to SISO digital library	SS & MP	4-MAY-2015	Closed
AI-M9-1	Send Dick Brown a reminder that we need his review of Ground examples	CB	4-MAY-2015	Closed
AI-M9-6	Initialize and TaskingReporting groups report whether they have enough information to start planning their work in parallel with completion of LDM draft.	RW & SD	14 -JUL-2015	Closed
AI-M10-8	Query C2SIM international participants regarding use of US standard NIEM in C2SIM	MP	03-SEP-2015	Closed
AI-M11-05	Interact with SISO management to convey our interest in Spring 2016 in-person meetings and learn what options they offer	MP	10-NOV-2015	Closed
AI-M14-05	Update C2SIM PN to include Thom DeCarlo and other participants as volunteers.	MP	10-NOV-2015	Closed

SISO C2SIM PDG

AI-M15-1	Create presentation on FIPA (high level view)	KGup	08-DEC-2015	Closed
AI-M15-2	Check if the LDM documentation was sent to the group, resend if necessary.	MP	2-FEB-2016	Closed
AI-M15-3	Create presentation on C2SIM-NIEM suggested interoperation	SS	08-DEC-2015	Closed
AI-M9-7	Report on approach to extending C2SIM while maintaining consistency, possibly based on US NIEM approach	RW & SD	12-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M14-06a	Filter MSDL Schema to provide minimal set of elements for LDM Core and more extensive set for Maneuver Warfare extension.	TD & RW	20-DEC-2015	Closed
AI-M14-06b	Draft TaskingReporting Powerpoint slides for review.	SD	12-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M16-1	Conversation with Diallo and Gupton to prepare for 13 Jan meeting	MP	20-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M16-2	Prepare slides describing relationship of LDM with MIM, FIPA, NIEM	KG	12-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M16-3	Prepare initial standard draft for C2SIM LDM	SS	12-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M15-2	Check if the LDM documentation was sent to the group, resend if necessary.	MP	12-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M17-1	Send the group updated LDM draft document, including procedure for conversion OWL to XML	SS	1-MAR-2016	Closed
AI-M17-3	Prepare document describing proposed approach to mandatory/optional elements in LDM, in format that could be used in the LDM standard.	RW	1-MAR-2016	Closed
AI-M17-2	Meet SISO's latest demand for data in order to advance the C-BML Guide to balloting.	CB	1-MAR-2016	Closed
AI-M18-1	Send updated LDM draft document with schema generation screenshots and OWL tools as appendices.	SS	1-MAR-2016	Closed
AI-M18-2	Send updated document describing proposed approach to mandatory/optional elements in LDM	RW	1-MAR-2016	Closed
AI-M18-3	Review and comment on version 4 LDM draft document (AI-18-2) and compliance terms document (AI-M18-2)	ALL	7-JUN-2016	Closed

SISO C2SIM PDG

AI-M20-1	Populate C2SIM LDM classes from MIM/C-BML/MSDL	SS	7-JUN-2016	Closed
AI-M20-2	Coordinate a subgroup teleconference to discuss and converge on C2SIM schema generation process	MP	30-MAY-2016	Closed
AI-M21-1	Send an email to the PDG with a description of the MIM tool suite	TR	7-JUN-2016	Closed
AI-M21-4	Recommend a process to scope the LDM core.	MP	5-JUL-2016	Closed
AI-M21-2	Identify and recommend tools in MIM tool suite that are useful to C2SIM.	KGup & SS	9-AUG-2016	Closed
AI-M22-1	Create a reduced/condensed LDM core for PDG review	SS	15-JUL-2016	Closed
AI-M21-3	Recommend solutions on the problem: “ how manually populated variants get recaptured in master LDM”	RW	30-AUG-2016	Closed
AI-M23-1	Create draft Initialization products	RW	30-AUG-2016	Closed
AI-M23-2	Create draft Tasking-Reporting product with initial use of FIPA	TR	30-AUG-2016	Closed
AI-M25-1	Prepare modified C2SIM Product Nomination; send to C2SIM email list, then submit to SAC.	Pullen	15-OCT-2016	Closed
AI-M25-2	Forward to DeCarlo for posting any documents from NATO CAX Forum that refer to MSDL/C-BML	Pullen	15-OCT-2016	Closed
AI-M26-1	Contact Galvin to send additional TIDE Sprint comments in email as necessary.	Pullen	02-NOV-2016	Closed
AI-M27-1	Follow up with Galvin to send additional TIDE Sprint comments in email as necessary.	Pullen	5-JAN-2016	Closed
AI-M28-1	Contact MSG-145 chair to coordinate joint online/in-person meeting	Pullen	7 FEB=2017	Closed
AI-M28-2	Email ACT contacts about C2SIM meeting at Tide SPRINT	Pullen	7-FEB-2017	Closed
AI-M28-3	Create and distribute Initialization draft	Wittman	23-JAN-2017	Closed

SISO C2SIM PDG

AI-M28-4	Create and distribute Tasking-Reporting draft	Remmersmann	23-JAN-2017	Closed
AI-M27-2	Send examples on how C2SIM initialization will model behavior	Wittman	7-MAR-2017	Closed
AI-M29-1	Send a draft presentation to the group on the use and need for a C2SIM ontology	Singapogu	1-MAR-2017	Closed
AI-M32-1	Send an email to the PDG with the proposed consolidated document organization	SS	6-MAY-2017	Closed
AI-M33-1	prepare initial draft Ontology from LDM Core UML	SS	26 June 2017	Closed
AI-M33-2	make presentations at meeting with MSG-145	Pullen, Galvin, Wittman, Singapogu	27 June 2017	Closed
AI-M34-1	Propose agenda for in-person meeting 14 Sep 2017	Pullen	1 Aug 2017	Closed
AI-M34-2	Organize meeting on items missing from consolidated draft and version of JC3IEDM	Wittman	14 July 2017	Closed
AI-M34-3	MSG-145 Geir Sletten memo issue tracking	Singapogu	1 Aug 2017	Closed
AI-M34-4	PN revision draft	Pullen	28 Aug 2017	Closed
AI-M35-1	Agenda and voting notices for meeting at SIW 2017	DeCarlo	1 Sep 2017	Closed
AI-M35-2	Post revisions to Consolidated Draft and Ontology	Singapogu	8 Aug 2017	Closed
AI-M35-3	Check whether reappointment of PDG/PSG officers is required- if needed add to agenda of SIW meeting	DeCarlo	1 Sep 2017	Closed
AI-M36-1	Verify voter list and add qualified voters to minutes for posting	TD	7-NOV	Closed
AI-M36-2	Synchronize Section 5 of the consolidated document to the OWL file.	SS	17-OCT	Closed
AI-	Present plans for completing Initialization in the consolidated draft (Section	RW	7-NOV	Closed

SISO C2SIM PDG

M36-4	7 and Appendix G)			
AI-M36-5	Provide update on the Maneuver Warfare extension	JR&JH	7-NOV	Closed
AI-M37-4	Check if supporting files are posted on the SISO website and post PSG annual report to the digital library.	CB	30-OCT	Closed
AI-M37-1	Send an email with list of classes that need definitions and ask those who can to supply the definitions	MP	5-DEC	Open
AI-M37-2	Review the plan to populate the Ontology with relationships between classes	MP	5-DEC	Closed
AI-M36-4	Present plans for completing Initialization in the consolidated draft (Section 7 and Appendix G)	RW	3 OCT	Closed
AI-M39-1	Prepare the Agenda for 25-JAN SIW meeting	MP	2-JAN	Closed
AO=M37-3	Online meetings to refine C2SIM Ontology and replace classes with dataTypes wherever appropriate (led by Doug Reece; members Xavier Cuneo and Samuel Singapogu, Curt Blais; Magdalena Wolski was invited after the meeting and accepted); last phase assisted by Jim Ruth	DR XC SS CB MW	6-FEB	Closed
AI-M36-3	Review consolidated document and use the issue tracker to create any issues	ALL	5-MAR	Closed
AI-M45-1	Draft Appendix B	CB	7-MAR	Closed
AI-M47-2	Send reminder emails to PDG/MSG-145 members about submitting updates to the document according to comments/volunteering in the March PDG meeting.	SS	13-APR-2018	Closed
AI-M47-1	Add names of MSG-145 members into the March PDG minutes	SS, TD, KG, MP	31-MAY-2018	Closed
AI-M47-3	Create C2SIM Maneuver extension ontology based on elements defined by Ruth and Hyndoy.	SS	15-MAY-2018	Closed
AI-M49-1	Finish scrub of LDM Core Ontology and initial review of Maneuver Warfare Extension (MWE) Ontology	DR	8-JUN-2018	Closed
AI-M49-2	Post new version of C2SIM Standard Draft, Core Ontology, and MWE Ontology	SS	15-JUN-2018	Closed
AI-M50-1	Prepare first draft of the narrative document of MWX ontology	SS	15-AUG-2018	Closed

SISO C2SIM PDG

AI-M50-2	Investigate automatic and usable generation of XML schema from the ontology	PDG sub-group	1-SEP-2018	Closed
AI-M51-1	Send email to PDG asking for ideas on naming/renaming the maneuver warfare extension	JR and DR	15-AUG-2018	Closed
AI-M53-1	Prepare first draft of the C2SIM guidance document and send to PDG	SS	30-OCT-2018	Closed
AI-M55-1	Send updated OWL-XSD transformation to the ontology community	CB	15-DEC-2018	Closed
AI-M54-1	Update and distribute OWL-XSD transformation rules	CB	15-DEC-2018	Closed
AI-M55-5	Create list of classes in LOX that pertain to generic military	JR	15-DEC-2018	Closed

ANNEX C – REOCCURRING ACTION ITEM TABLE (ordered by Action Item number)

ACTION ITEM TABLE				
<i>AI ID</i>	<i>Description</i>	<i>Assignee</i>	<i>Due date</i>	<i>Status</i>